Eviction Impact Assessment

Applications: Counting real costs

Habitat International Coalition - Housing and Land Rights Network
INCIDENT, CONTEXT

- Conflict
- Conflict (civil war), Transitional justice
- Development (land concession)
- Development project
- Disaster (flood)
- Gentrification
- Infrastructure project
- Land grab
- Mega-event
- Military occupation, punitive
- Punitive
- Transitional justice
- Combinations of the above
Type(s) of Violation

- Eviction
- Dispossession
- Damage, destruction
- Privatization
- Lost inheritance
- Other
STAGE

- Pre-violation
- During violation
- Post-violation
Redress Sought

- Juridical
- Administrative
- Customary / traditional
- Other
- Redress status
Inga 3: DRC
Pre-eviction
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mariés</th>
<th>Vivant en union de fait</th>
<th>Célibataires</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eff.</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Eff.</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>Eff.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mvuzi 3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7,0</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>74,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lubuaku</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>75,4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lundu</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2,0</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>81,2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kilengo</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0,0</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>70,3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2,2</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>75,2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Baljeet Nagar – Delhi

Intervention during eviction

- 23–24 March 2011, DDA demolished ca. 1,000 houses
- No prior notice
- Reason for demolition not clear
- Residents not allowed time to remove personal belongings
- 5 bulldozers and a large armed police force arrived at 07:00
- Violence/force used against residents
Bhaljeet Nagar, Delhi

- DDA extorts money from residents: for a wall = RS.10K, house = Rs.30K
- Livelihoods integral to living spaces.
- Most children attend local government schools.
- No warning. Police and bulldozers arrived @ 07:00–8:00, 23 March 2011, using violence, especially against women.

Methods/challenges:
- Questionnaire took one hour to fill
- Peoples Tribunal (public hearing) on site, then
- Debt liabilities (pawned items irretrievable after eviction)
- Added “bribes/extortion” category based on local testimonies (as separate from “bureaucratic costs”).
- Some big losers left the area and were not reachable for the survey
- Tenure-affirming documents lost
- Will go back to follow up, especially to see if (1/12) children drop outs resumed school and/or child labor increased
Findings:

- Many job losses (calculated @ Rs. 400)
- Monthly food expenditure fell by Rs. 400; victims ate less.
- Water expenditures increased by Rs. 600
- Average Rs. 60 K, but some lost Rs. 400 K
- 5-yr-old boy lost sight in one eye
- Rs. 7-30 K more/mo. health expenditures
- At time, no one replaced ration cards, but not monetized
Cameroon: Yaoundé & Douala

- CIAH-Cameroon and CONGEH trained 30 young data collectors (09/10), using SPSS
- Collected information for 10 days in neighborhoods Messa-Career and Mbankolo (Yaoundé)
- 6 data collectors counted data over 15 days with CIAH/CONGEH coordination team
- November 2011, CESCR parallel report
- Analysis by an engineer, statistician, report writers, publishing a book on evictions in Cameroon cities & validated in stakeholder workshop.
Urgent Action

Cameroon:
Hundreds of families risk eviction
> 2K people facing eviction
Demolition Threatens 3K Families
Yaounde, >250 Families Homeless
397 Douala Families in Distress
Forced Eviction

Post-eviction Impact

Topsia, Kolkata, West Bengal, India

- 383 Muslim families Muslim belonging to extremely marginalized groups, including Other Backward Classes, Scheduled Castes, tribals (“criminal tribes” under British rule),
- 30–40 year residence.

Forced eviction,
Home demolition,
Contents lost and destroyed,
No adequate notice; public consultation; prior and informed consent; alternative accommodation, either temporary or permanent
Housing and Land Rights Network & Apne Aap Women Worldwide’s (AAWW) Study

Objectives:

Losses suffered by 383 HHs (200 HHs surveyed)

• Post-eviction (long-term) changes in livelihoods, incomes, consumption patterns, and standard of living
Economic losses:

- Current replacement values of property
- Household items
- Food
- Inviolate or priceless assets
- Loss of mortgaged properties
- Loss of investment in the demolished structure
- Loss of vital documents (including ration cards, voter cards, and important certificates)
- Change in monthly expenditure on food, water, electricity, local transport, healthcare, and education of children
- Change in income and livelihoods
Non-economic losses:

- Sexual violence against girls and women
- Increase in debt bondage
- Forced labour and other human trafficking
- Loss of security and safety
- Social capital: community networks
- Mothers and family breadwinners missing or distanced from employers
- Children and women access to community centres
- 4 pregnant women injured, 1 baby lost
## Loss of Assets during Demolition (Indian rupees – INRs)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Purchase Price</th>
<th>Current Market / Replacement Price</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Household Items</td>
<td>4,756,597</td>
<td>8,159,627</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Items</td>
<td>177,329</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inviolate/Priceless Assets</td>
<td>4,093</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jewellery and Cash</td>
<td>545,775</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>4,029,160</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vital Documents</td>
<td>497,324</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Expenditure on Healthcare (INR)

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>During Eviction</td>
<td>325,742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-eviction</td>
<td>337,006</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service</th>
<th>Amount (INR)</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Electricity</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>359</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Reconstruction of Housing (INR)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Before Eviction</th>
<th>After Eviction</th>
<th>Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boys' Education</td>
<td>607</td>
<td>761</td>
<td>25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Girls' Education</td>
<td>530</td>
<td>716</td>
<td>35%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>384</td>
<td>89%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Household Expenditure on Food</td>
<td>2,667</td>
<td>3,623</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Per Capita Expenditure on Food</td>
<td>535</td>
<td>745</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Public hearing

INRs 12,000 per household in exchange for cooperation with Karaya Police Station
Justice Musinga ruled:

1. That the honourable court be pleased to issue a temporary injunction against the respondents, their servants, agents, and other such persons claiming under the respondents from demolishing, evicting, terminating leases or tenancies, transferring or in any way interfering or alienating the suit premises.

2. That an order compelling the respondents jointly and severally to reconnect sewerage systems, water supply and toilet facilities, perimeter fence and other amenities to the suit premises.

3. That the respondents be compelled to accept rent from the petitioners and the persons they represent forthwith or in the alternative, to deposit the same with the court.

4. That an order that the respondents pay the costs of this application.

5. Such other relief as this honourable court may deem fit to grant.
Objectives:

- Describe the basic characteristics of the households,
- Assess quality of housing conditions & HH amenities,
- Record goods (movable assets) HH owned & values,
- Assess one-time cost & duration for relocation of the households due to a potential eviction,
- Assess the increase in household expenditure for relocation due to a potential eviction.
Findings: Additional recurrent expenditure due to displacement

- **Transport**: total additional cost of relocation per month for 40 households = Ksh. 834,540 (€7,620), or Ksh. 19,733 (€180) on average;

- New nursery schools, health facilities, worship spaces, and recreation centers closer to their new location = Ksh.12,766 (€117)/month.
Conclusions:

- General loss of well-being: Housing & amenities, health, safety, comfort, etc.;
- Since October 2010, loss housing quality (intangible cost);
- Loss of easy physical access to facilities: work, school, healthcare, childcare, recreation and worship, general CBD services (both a tangible and intangible cost);
- Loss of mutual support & benefits of inter-HH relations & social bonds forged over time (intangible cost);
- If HH secure equivalent housing and amenities at same rent, they would have to relocate 20 kms from CBD, & HH expenditure for transport alone increase by average Kshs. 19,733 (€160)/month, eventually reducing to Kshs. 12,766 (€117)/ month (tangible cost) + added travel time (intangible cost).
Such displacement would be far beyond the means of the households, driving HHs to places with worse housing conditions and access to facilities and services;

The HHs are needy & their displacement will make them worse off;

This displacement aggravates urban poverty situation of Nairobi.

However, the findings of this quantification exercise should aid the judge to mitigate that impoverishment through the final court ruling—now expected in March 2013—by determining:

“such other relief as this honourable court may deem fit to grant.”
المحتويات التقدير النوعي والكمي للمتعلقات الشخصية، والسلع المنزلية في المسكن
والمجهودات الخاصة لاستخدامات الأسرة
واللهامات لانتقاء الأدوات والمناخ والخصائص التالية لاستخدامات معيثة الأسرة
النوعي والكمي للمتعلقات الشخصية، والسلع المنزلية في المسكن
واللهامات لانتقاء الأدوات والمناخ والخصائص التالية لاستخدامات معيثة الأسرة

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>المبلغ</th>
<th>الواردات</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>195,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>169,000</td>
<td>130,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300,822,000</td>
<td>190,589,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

النوعي والكمي للمتعلقات الشخصية، والسلع المنزلية في المسكن
واللهامات لانتقاء الأدوات والمناخ والخصائص التالية لاستخدامات معيثة الأسرة
النوعي والكمي للمتعلقات الشخصية، والسلع المنزلية في المسكن
واللهامات لانتقاء الأدوات والمناخ والخصائص التالية لاستخدامات معيثة الأسرة

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>المبلغ</th>
<th>الواردات</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>195,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>169,000</td>
<td>130,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300,822,000</td>
<td>190,589,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

النوعي والكمي للمتعلقات الشخصية، والسلع المنزلية في المسكن
واللهامات لانتقاء الأدوات والمناخ والخصائص التالية لاستخدامات معيثة الأسرة
النوعي والكمي للمتعلقات الشخصية، والسلع المنزلية في المسكن
واللهامات لانتقاء الأدوات والمناخ والخصائص التالية لاستخدامات معيثة الأسرة

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>المبلغ</th>
<th>الواردات</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>195,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>169,000</td>
<td>130,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300,822,000</td>
<td>190,589,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

النوعي والكمي للمتعلقات الشخصية، والسلع المنزلية في المسكن
واللهامات لانتقاء الأدوات والمناخ والخصائص التالية لاستخدامات معيثة الأسرة
النوعي والكمي للمتعلقات الشخصية، والسلع المنزلية في المسكن
واللهامات لانتقاء الأدوات والمناخ والخصائص التالية لاستخدامات معيثة الأسرة

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>المبلغ</th>
<th>الواردات</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>195,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>130,000</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>169,000</td>
<td>130,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>50,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300,822,000</td>
<td>190,589,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
"Assessing Impacts of Women’s Dispossession of Land and Home"

Counting real costs

A project of Habitat International Coalition - Housing and Land Rights Network